

## **Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation**

*Anālayo*

*Even the hour of death might still send  
Us freshly out to new dimensions,  
Life's calling us will never end,  
Come then, my heart, take leave, be well!<sup>1</sup>*

### **Introduction**

In what follows I survey selected passages among the early Buddhist discourses on the topic of death. Then I translate a discourse from the Chinese *Ekottarika-āgama* that describes recollection of death. In order to evaluate the significance of the form of practice delineated in this discourse, I then relate its instructions to modern-day research on how the fact of death affects human behaviour.

### **Perspectives on Death in Early Buddhist Discourse**

Death as a fundamental problem of human life is a central topic in early Buddhist thought,<sup>2</sup> explicitly taken up in what tradition considers to have been the first teaching given by the recently-awakened Buddha, the *Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta*.<sup>3</sup> The main teaching delivered in this discourse takes the form of four truths, a presentation apparently inspired by ancient Indian medical diagnosis.<sup>4</sup> The disease diagnosed with the help of the first of these four truths is *dukkha*, a term whose compass of meaning ranges from outright pain to the unsatisfactory nature of all conditioned phenomena. Here is the formulation of the first of these four truths

from the *Ekottarika-āgama* parallel to the *Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta*:<sup>5</sup>

What is reckoned as the truth of *dukkha*? It is this: Birth is *dukkha*, old age is *dukkha*, disease is *dukkha*, death is *dukkha*, [as well as] grief, vexation, affliction, worry and pains that cannot be measured; <sup>6</sup> association with what is disliked is *dukkha*, dissociation from what is loved is *dukkha*, not getting what one wishes is also *dukkha*; stated in brief, the five aggregates of clinging are *dukkha* – this is reckoned as the truth of *dukkha*.

This first of the four truths presents death – together with birth, old age, and disease – as manifestations of *dukkha*. Note that in this formulation birth stands on a par with death. This not only expresses the fact that the actual experience of birth is painful for both mother and child, but also reflects the intrinsic connection between birth and death. Every birth inevitably results in death. When considered from this perspective, it becomes clear that the doctrine of rebirth does not automatically solve the problem of death. Although belief in rebirth can be expected to lessen the impact of the fear of death, it does not provide a lasting solution.<sup>7</sup> The cycle of rebirths, *saṃsāra*, is at the same time a cycle of re-deaths.<sup>8</sup>

In the Buddhist scheme of the four truths, the first truth is followed by the second truth, which highlights that craving is responsible for the arising of *dukkha*. This directs attention back towards oneself; the problem is not so much the world outside, but rather the way how one relates to it. Applied to the case of death, the stronger one's grasping, craving, and attachments are, the more threatening death will be. Fear of death can be seen as a measuring rod of one's degree of attachment to this particular embodied existence.

The third truth regarding the cessation of *dukkha* then implies that it is possible to have an attitude towards death and dying that is free from *dukkha*. Letting go of craving and attachment is what leads to increasing degrees of freedom from the fear of death.

The fourth truth delineates the practical path to be undertaken in order to arrive at inner freedom from the fear of death. This practical

### **Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 583**

path requires combining a foundation in moral conduct with a systematic training of the mind.

In this way, when viewed from the viewpoint of the four truths, the threat posed by death and dying can become a central motivating force for dedicating oneself to moral conduct and mental cultivation through meditation.<sup>9</sup>

According to the *Ariyapariyesanā-sutta* and its *Madhyama-āgama* parallel, death – together with birth, old age, and disease – was indeed a crucial motivating force for the Buddha-to-be to set out on his quest for awakening. The relevant passage in the *Madhyama-āgama* version reads as follows:<sup>10</sup>

Formerly, when I had not yet awakened to supreme, right, and complete awakening, I thought like this: 'I am actually subject to disease myself and I naively search for what is subject to disease, I am actually subject to old age ... subject to death ... subject to worry and sadness ... subject to defilement myself and I naively search for what is subject to defilement.<sup>11</sup> What if I now rather search for the supreme peace of Nirvāṇa, which is free from disease, [if I now rather] search for the supreme peace of Nirvāṇa, which is free from old age ... free from death ... free from worry and sadness... free from defilement?'

Once awakened and about to share his discovery (with the audience of the *Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta*), according to the *Ariyapariyesanā-sutta* the Buddha announced that he had attained the "deathless".<sup>12</sup> Thus death forms a continuous theme in the description of the Buddha's quest, awakening, and teaching activity.

According to a discourse in the *Aṅguttara-nikāya* and its parallels, the existence of death, together with old age and disease, motivates a Buddha to appear in the world and deliver his teachings. Here is the corresponding statement from the *Samyukta-āgama* parallel:<sup>13</sup>

There are three conditions in the world that one is unable to rejoice in, unable to be fond of, [often even] unable to recollect. What are the three? They are: old age, disease,

and death. One is unable to rejoice in, unable to be fond of, [often even] unable to recollect these three conditions.<sup>14</sup>

If in the world there were not these three conditions that one is unable to rejoice in, unable to be fond of, [often even] unable to recollect, a Tathāgata would not emerge in the world, an accomplished and fully awakened one, and the world would not come to know the Tathāgata's teaching of the Dharma and instructing in the Vinaya, his providing of guidance.

In early Buddhist thought two deities are related to death: Māra and Yama. A chief role of Māra, whose name literally means "death",<sup>15</sup> could perhaps be captured as that of a devious deity. His main mission is to advocate sensual enjoyment and to discourage renunciation,<sup>16</sup> for the sake of which he undertakes all kinds of mischief.<sup>17</sup> As soon as he is recognized, however, his power is lost and he has to withdraw in defeat.

The function of Yama as the Lord of Death in early Buddhist texts is rather to embody conscience.<sup>18</sup> His task is to remind evil doers of their past bad deeds and draw attention to the karmic retribution to be expected after they have passed away. Whereas Māra's power is lost upon recognition, with Yama no escape is possible.

These two deities can be understood to represent complementary aspects of the early Buddhist approach to death. Yama brings out the sobering aspect of death, the fact that unwholesome activities will have long-term detrimental repercussions. The inevitability of one's own and others' death lends value to blameless behaviour and divests many of one's ordinary pursuits of their importance. In short, priorities in life are clarified. Māra, in contrast, represents fear of death. All this requires is clear recognition. When death is faced with awareness, fear of death loses its power.

How to go about learning to face death is the topic of two discourses in the *Aṅguttara-nikāya* and their parallel in the *Ekottarika-āgama*. The parallel versions agree that the Buddha examined how his monk disciples were practicing recollection of

death. In what follows I translate the discourse version found in the *Ekottarika-āgama*.<sup>19</sup>

### **Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation**

Thus have I heard. At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park.<sup>20</sup> At that time the Blessed One said to the monks: "You should cultivate the perception of death and give attention to the perception of death".<sup>21</sup>

Then one monk among those seated there said to the Blessed One: "I constantly cultivate giving attention to the perception of death."

The Blessed One said: "How do you give attention to cultivating the perception of death?"

The monk said to the Buddha: "At the time of giving attention to the perception of death, I have the aspiration to remain [alive] for seven days and give attention to the seven awakening factors. In the Tathāgata's teaching that will be of much benefit [to me] and I will not regret passing away after that. Blessed One, it is in this way that I give attention to the perception of death."

The Blessed One said: "Stop, stop, monk, this is not [really] an undertaking of the practice of the perception of death. This is called being of a negligent nature."

Again one monk said to the Blessed One: "I am capable in cultivating the perception of death."

The Blessed One said: "How do you cultivate and attend to the perception of death?"

The monk said to the Buddha: "Now I have this reflection: 'I have the aspiration to remain [alive] for [at least] six days and, having given attention to the right teachings of the Tathāgata, then might reach the end of life. This will thus be for my good fortune.' In this way I attend to the perception of death".

The Blessed One said: "Stop, stop, monk, you are also of a negligent nature. This is not [really] attending to the

perception of death."

Again a monk said to the Buddha: "I aspire to remain [alive] for [at least] five days." Someone said for [at least] four days, someone said for [at least] three days ... two days ... one day.

At that time the Blessed One said to the monks: "Stop, stop, monks, this is also being of a negligent nature, this is not [really] attending to the perception of death."

At that time there was again one monk who said to the Blessed One: "I am able and fit to cultivate the perception of death."<sup>22</sup> The monk said to the Buddha: "When the time has come, I put on my robes, take the alms bowl, and enter Sāvattḥī to beg alms.<sup>23</sup> Having begged alms I turn back to leave Sāvattḥī and return to my place. I enter my meditation hut to give attention to the seven factors of awakening. Then I might reach the end of life. It is thus that I attend to the perception of death."

The Blessed One said: "Stop, stop, monk, this is also not [really] giving attention to and cultivating the perception of death. Monks, you all spoke of negligent ways of practice. This is not [really] of the nature of cultivating the perception of death."

At that time the Blessed One again spoke to the monks: "Those who are able to be like the monk Vakkalī,<sup>24</sup> they are indeed reckoned to be giving attention to the perception of death. That monk is well able to give attention to the perception of death, being disenchanted with this foul and unclean body.

If a monk gives attention to the perception of death, collecting his mindfulness in front [of himself],<sup>25</sup> with a mind that is unshaken, mindful of the out-breath and the in-breath for the time it takes for them to go out and return, and during that period he gives attention to the seven awakening factors, that would indeed be of much benefit [to him] in the Tathāgata's teaching. This is because all formations are entirely empty, they all become appeased, they rise and cease, they are all [like] a magical illusion that is without any true essence.<sup>26</sup>

## **Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 587**

Therefore, monks, you should give attention to the perception of death in the interval between an out-breath and an in-breath, so that you will be liberated from birth, old age, disease, death, grief, worry, pain, and vexation.<sup>27</sup> In this way, monks, should you train yourselves."<sup>28</sup>

At that time the monks, hearing what the Buddha had said, were delighted and received it respectfully.

The two parallels in the *Āṅguttara-nikāya* begin with the case of a monk who thinks of staying alive for a single day and night in order to give attention to the Buddha's teaching.<sup>29</sup> The shorter of the two discourses (AN 6.19) then continues with living for a single day, for the time of a single meal, the time of swallowing several mouthfuls, the time of a single mouthful, and the time of breathing in and out. The longer of the two discourses (AN 8.73) adds to these the time of half a day and the time of half a meal. In both versions the Buddha commends those who expect to live for the time it takes to swallow a single mouthful or the time of breathing in and out.<sup>30</sup>

The central message conveyed in these two discourses as well as in the *Ekottarika-āgama* version translated above is clearly that recollection of death needs to be applied right to the present moment. This need arises from the certainty of death that comes combined with the uncertainty of the time when this will happen. Those who envisage their own death to take place at some more distant time in the future, even if this is only at the distance of a single day, are considered to be negligent in their practice. Instead, acknowledging one's own mortality needs to be coupled with the awareness that one might die right now.<sup>31</sup> This is the key to proper practice.<sup>32</sup>

### **Perspectives on Death**

The close relationship between birth and death was already taken up by de Montaigne in the sixteenth century, when he pointed out that dying begins the moment we are born.<sup>33</sup> Proceeding to reflections on death in modern times, based on her experience of working with the terminally ill, Kübler-Ross emphasizes the need to turn awareness to one's own mortality:<sup>34</sup>

"I believe that we should make it a habit to think about death and dying." She explains that "it might be helpful if more people would talk about death and dying as an intrinsic part of life just as they do not hesitate to mention when someone is expecting a new baby." According to her assessment, "if all of us would make an all-out effort to contemplate our own death, to deal with our anxieties surrounding the concept of death, and to help others familiarize themselves with these thoughts, perhaps there could be less destructiveness around us."

Facing one's own death when still alive offers the best preparation for being able to live well the actual moment of death. The potential of such practice is not confined to learning to face death itself, but also enables one to live without the deadening effects of the fear of death. Only when death has become a natural part of life will it be possible to go beyond the influence of existential fear and thereby become fully alive to life as it unfolds in the present moment.

The pervasiveness of the existential fear of death has been formulated by Becker in his Pulitzer Prize winning study of *The Denial of Death* as follows:

The idea of death, the fear of it, haunts the human animal like nothing else; it is a mainspring of human activity — activity designed largely to avoid the fatality of death, to overcome it by denying in some way that it is the final destiny of man.<sup>35</sup>

The repercussions of the fear of death on various aspects of human behaviour have been studied in detail in modern psychology, leading to the development of the "Terror Management Theory", a theory on how human beings manage existential terror.<sup>36</sup> The basic problem could be summarized as follows:

The fear of death is rooted in an instinct for self-preservation that humans share with other species. Although we share this instinct with other species, only we are aware that death is inevitable — that is, that our self-preservation instinct will inevitably be thwarted. This combination of an instinctive drive for self-preservation with an awareness of the inevitability of death creates the potential for paralyzing terror.<sup>37</sup>



## **Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 589**

Research undertaken on this paralyzing terror has led to a better understanding of the ways it can affect a whole range of aspects of human behaviour and activities.

The problem of death resides beneath consciousness and, from there, triggers distal death defenses – the maintenance of worldviews and self-esteem. The conscious contemplation of death is defended against... by denying vulnerability to physical death or pushing it into the distant future.<sup>38</sup>

When thoughts of death are in current focal attention, the individual responds with proximal defenses that attempt to deal with the problem of death ... by either distracting oneself from the issue or pushing the problem of death into the distant future.<sup>39</sup>

So the terror of death, as long as it is unresolved, leads to defence mechanisms. One of these is to push death into the distant future, precisely the problem that according to the *Ekottarika-āgama* discourse translated above and its parallels had met with the Buddha's criticism. Another defence mechanisms comes into play as soon as awareness of one's own mortality is no longer at the forefront of one's attention.

Death thoughts are often too threatening to be kept in focal attention for an extended time ... once death thoughts have receded from focal attention, people rely on a dual-component, cultural anxiety buffer, consisting of a cultural worldview and self-esteem, to manage the implicit knowledge of their inevitable death. People create and maintain a system of beliefs and practices (a cultural worldview) that provides order and meaning in life, standards of value to attain, and protection against death in the form of symbolic immortality." When reminded of their own mortality, "people (a) respond more negatively to those who oppose their beliefs and respond more positively to those who support their values (cultural worldview defense) and (b) strive to meet cultural standards of value (self-esteem striving). Both types of distal defense are used to manage existential terror.<sup>40</sup>

In this way, fear of death extends its various arms like a polyp into building up and fortifying one's sense of identity. This provides a background for the relationship drawn in the early Buddhist texts between recollection of death and awakening, the realization of the deathless. Fear of death is intimately connected with one's holding on to a sense of identity, *sakkāya*. One who has fully realized the truth of not-self thereby goes beyond the fear of death. The medicine required to bring about this cure is surprisingly simple: attend to the possibility that death could happen here and now. It just requires bringing one's own mortality into present moment awareness, right now.

\*\*\*\*\*

### Abbreviations

AN	<i>Aṅguttara-nikāya</i>
DĀ	<i>Dirgha-āgama</i> (T 1)
EĀ	<i>Ekottarika-āgama</i> (T 125)
MĀ	<i>Madhyama-āgama</i> (T 26)
MN	<i>Majjhima-nikāya</i>
Ps	<i>Papañcasūdanī</i>
SĀ	<i>Samyukta-āgama</i> (T 99)
SN	<i>Samyutta-nikāya</i>
T	Taishō edition (CBETA)

### Notes

- \* I am indebted to Adam Clarke and Sāmaṇerī Dhammadinnā for commenting on a draft version of this article. In order to facilitate comparison with the for most readers probably more familiar Pāli versions, when translating from the Chinese I employ Pāli terminology for proper names and doctrinal terms, except for the terms Dharma and Nirvāṇa, which by now have become an accepted part of English vocabulary. All translations are my own. The first part of the present article incorporates revised extracts from Anālayo (2007).
1. Hesse (1943/1972,484): "Es wird vielleicht auch noch die Todesstunde, uns neuen Räumen jung entgegen senden, des Lebens Ruf an uns wird niemals enden ...Wohlan denn, Herz, nimm Abschied und gesunde!"

## **Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 591**

2. Klein (1991/1998, 47) points out that "discussions of impermanence and death are at the heart of Buddhism's understanding of the human situation and [of Buddhism's] recommendations for its transformation."
3. SN 56.11 at SN V 420, 22.
4. For a more detailed discussion cf. Anālayo (2011b).
5. EĀ 24.5 at T II 619a10 to a14. Here I only note variations between EĀ 24.5 and SN 56.11; for a comparative study and translations of the parallel versions preserved in Chinese translation, including a full translation of EĀ 24.5, cf. Anālayo (2012 and 2013a).
6. SN 56.11 at SN V 421, 22 does not qualify grief, etc., as beyond measuring.
7. Blum (2004, 203) points out that "belief in transmigration thus does not remove the sense of insecurity that accompanies death."
8. Bond (1980, 240f) comments that "Buddhism, along with other Indian traditions, understood *samsāra* as 're-death'". Kariyawasam (1984, 33) sums up that "death and birth follow each other. If death be the backward view of life, birth is its forward view. They are two aspects of the same phenomenon." Reynolds (1992, 160) explains that "within this continuing process of birth, death, rebirth ... death continues to function as a limit that calls into question the value of all of the satisfactions and pleasures that can be realized within this-worldly existence. But in the specifically Buddhist context it does so as a transition that poses a limit by virtue of its continuing recurrence rather than by its absolute finality in any given case." As Karunaratne (2002a, 635) notes, "death is of course a fact of existence, but the doctrine points out and stresses that repeated death results from the pursuit of sensual pleasures" (punctuation adjusted).
9. Amore (1974, 117) notes that "the decision to 'renounce the world' and undertake the life of a wandering ascetic was, then, an attempt to resolve the existential problem of 'being toward death'"; cf. also Gunaratne (1982) und Walshe (1978). Klima (2002, 173 and 198) comments that "the spiritual economy of Buddhist asceticism values death as an end in itself; it confronts death straight on, and exchanges its repulsive visage for release"

through "an intimate confrontation with the painful and disappointing tendency of the body to fall apart and die. It is the practitioners' belief that only by coming to terms with this truth can one ever escape from being emotionally subject to it."

10. MĀ 204 at T I 776a26 to b1; for a translation and discussion of the first part of this discourse cf. Anālayo (2011a).
11. The parallel MN 26 at MN I 163, 16 also mentions birth.
12. MN 26 at MN I 172, 1 records the Buddha announcing that "the deathless has been reached". The parallel MĀ 204 at T I 777c16 similarly reports the Buddha referring to the deathless at this juncture, which here comes together with affirming that he had reached a condition that is free from disease and old age, etc. Vetter (1995, 219) comments that to have reached the deathless would mean that death is no longer frightening, "führen mich zu der Annahme, der Ausspruch '*amata* ist erlangt' bedeute, daß der Tod nicht mehr gefürchtet wird, weder hier und jetzt, noch in einem Jenseits; und auch daß aktuelle Todesangst ausgeschlossen ist." Vogel (1978, 151f) reasons that awakening in a way anticipates death (in the sense of one's ceasing to be of the world), the difference between the two being a formal one instead of an essential one, "so wird in der Erleuchtung der Tod vorweggenommen, und der Tod erfährt Sinn und Wert durch die Erleuchtung. Zwischen ihnen besteht lediglich ein Formunterschied, kein Wesensunterschied."
13. SĀ 760 at T II 199c28 to 200a4; cf. also the closely similar statement found in SĀ 346 at T II 95c22 and in the Sanskrit fragment parallel, Tripāṭhī (1962, 205,1 §25.2).
14. AN 10.76 at AN V 144, 9 only lists the three conditions, without highlighting that one is unable to delight in them, etc.
15. Malalasekera (1938/1998, 613) explains in relation to Māra that "the commonest use of the word was evidently in the sense of Death. From this it was extended to mean 'the world under the sway of death' ... thence, the *kilesas* [defilements] also came to be called Māra in that they were instruments of Death, the causes enabling Death to hold sway over the world." According to Wayman (1959, 113), Māra corresponds to "metaphorical values of 'death' and in one of the values – so to say the 'zero value' – the word means the concrete death."

### Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 593

16. Tradition considers Māra as a denizen of the sense-sphere heavens. Thus DĀ 30 at T I 115a28 indicates that Māra's palace is located between the highest heavenly realm of the sense-sphere and the Brahmā world (on the late nature of this discourse cf. Anālayo (2014b). The *Yogācārabhūmi*, Bhattacharya (1957: 75, 7), and the Pāli commentarial tradition, Ps I 34, 1, also associate him with the top realm among the sense-sphere heavens; cf. also Bareau (1986, 39). Guruge (1997, 28f) explains that "in earlier times, Māra was yet a *devaputta* [god]", but "later on ... he becomes more and more pronouncedly demonic."
17. For a more detailed study of Māra's function, which decidedly is not merely the acting out of inner defilements of those he challenges, cf. Anālayo (2014a, 116–119).
18. Marasinghe (2002, 631) explains that Yama is "the Ṛg Vedic god of death and the king and ruler of the underworld", who in early Buddhism exemplifies the "operation of the law of kamma". The manifestation of feelings of regret and guilt in relation to what one has done appears to be in fact an easily observable feature among terminally ill; cf., e.g., Saunders and Baines (1983/1989, 52).
19. EĀ 40.8 at T II 741c27 to 742b2; cf. also Anālayo (2013b, 104–106), and on the practice of recollection of death in general, Boisvert (1996) and Karunaratne (2002b). As noted by Harvey (1991, 106), in Buddhist thought in general "the inevitability of death is seen as a fruitful topic for reflection and meditation." A different perspective emerges in the *Kakṣapuṭatantra*, which provides teachings not only on how to predict the time of death, but even on how supposedly to avoid it; cf. Yamano (2014).
20. The two discourse parallels in the *Aṅguttara-nikāya*, AN 6.19 at AN III 303, 23 and AN 8.73 at AN IV 316, 22, instead have the Brick Hall at Nādika as their venue.
21. In AN 6.19 at AN III 304,4 and AN 8.73 at AN IV 317,4 the Buddha highlights the benefits of recollection of death in leading to the deathless. Bodhi (2012, 1753 note 1283) comments that "it is interesting to note that mindfulness of death culminates in the deathless."

22. Adopting the variant 任 instead of 忍, in keeping with the formulation used earlier.
23. Adopting a variant that adds 乞食.
24. AN 6.19 and AN 8.73 do not mention Vakkali. According to the listings of outstanding disciples in AN 1.14 at AN I 24,15 and EĀ 4.5 at T II 557c20, Vakkali was foremost among those liberated by faith; for a comparative study of the canonical records of his suicide cf. Anālayo (2011c).
25. Adopting the variant 念 instead of 意.
26. Whereas AN 6.19 and AN 8.73 do not make such an indication, to some extent comparable statement can be found in T 1509 at T XXV 228b8.
27. AN 6.19 at AN III 306, 15 and AN 8.73 at AN IV 319, 32 conclude by highlighting that training in the recollection of death can lead to the destruction of the influxes (*āsava*).
28. Adopting the variant 作 instead of 知作如.
29. AN 6.19 at AN III 304, 9 and AN 8.73 at AN IV 317, 9. A discourse quotation in T 1509 at T XXV 228a25, translated in Lamotte (1970, 1424f), begins with the idea of living for seven years, and then proceeds to seven months, seven days, six days, five days, four days, three days, two days, one day, the time of a meal, and the time of breathing in and out. The Buddha commends the last case.
30. The different versions agree closely in referring just to the experience of inhalation and exhalation as such, without in any way qualifying their lengths. This shows that Cousins 2015: 3 is not correct in stating that, "significantly, there does not appear to be anywhere in the canonical literature where meditation on the normal breath is recommended. Rather, it should always be made long or short in the practice of mindfulness with in and out breathing."
31. Bowker (1991, 187) explains that "Mindfulness of Death is a concentration ... on the fact that death (*maraṇa*) is approaching *me*. It is not a meditation on death in general, but on its application to me." That application, as the above discourses show, moreover needs to be related right to the present moment,

## Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 595

i.e., death is *right now* approaching *me*. As noted by Wayman (1982, 289), such practice then leadsto "a kind of conversion of the mind, a 'death' from previous ways of thinking by way of contemplating death". The potential of mindfulness to lead to a reduction of defence mechanisms against the fear of death has been corroborated in a series of experiments; cf. Niemic et al. (2010).

32. As Schmidt-Leukel (1984, 166) points out, from a Buddhist viewpoint the existential question that death poses to human beings can be solved in life, in fact it can *only* be solved in life. It not only *can* be solved, it *must* be solved, "die existentielle Anfrage des Todes an den Menschen kann nach buddhistischer Auffassung im Leben gelöst und zwar *nur* im Leben gelöst werden. Sie *kann* aber nicht nur gelöst werden, sie *muß* auch gelöst werden."
33. de Montaigne (1588/1595, 128): "vous estes mort après la vie, mais pendant la vie vous estes mourant", that is, "after life you are dead, but you are dying all the while you live."
34. The quotes are taken from Kübler-Ross (1969/1982, 26, 125, and 12).
35. Becker (1973, xvii).
36. Greenberg et al. (1986).
37. Harmon-Jones et al. (1997, 24).
38. Burke et al. (2010, 156).
39. Pyszczynski et al. (2004, 445).
40. Niemic et al. (2010, 345).

## References

- Amore, R.C. 1974. "The Heterodox Philosophical Systems", in *Death and Eastern Thought: Understanding Death in Eastern Religions and Philosophies*, F. Holck (ed.), 114–163, Nashville: Abingdon Press.
- Anālayo. 2007. "Der Tod aus der Perspektive der frühbuddhistischen Schriften", in *Sterben, Tod und Trauer in den Religionen und*

*Kulturen der Welt; Gemeinsamkeiten und Besonderheiten in Theorie und Praxis*, C. Elsas (ed.), 111–130, Hamburg: EB Verlag.

- Anālayo. 2011a. "Brahmā's Invitation, The Ariyapariyesanā-sutta in the Light of its Madhyama-āgama Parallel", *Journal of the Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies*, 1: 12–38.
- Anālayo. 2011b. "Right View and the Scheme of the Four Truths in Early Buddhism, The Saṃyukta-āgama Parallel to the Sammādiṭṭhi-sutta and the Simile of the Four Skills of a Physician", *Canadian Journal of Buddhist Studies*, 7: 11–44.
- Anālayo. 2011c. "Vakkali's Suicide in the Chinese Āgamas", *Buddhist Studies Review*, 28.2: 155–170.
- Anālayo. 2012. "The Chinese Parallels to the Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta (1)", *Journal of the Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies*, 3: 12–46.
- Anālayo. 2013a. "The Chinese Parallels to the Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta (2)", *Journal of the Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies*, 5: 9–41.
- Anālayo. 2013b. *Perspectives on Satipaṭṭhāna*, Cambridge: Windhorse.
- Anālayo. 2014a. "Defying Māra – Bhikkhunīs in the Saṃyukta-āgama", in *Women in Early Indian Buddhism: Comparative Textual Studies*, A. Collett (ed.), 116–139, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Anālayo. 2014b. "Three Chinese Dīrgha-āgama Discourses Without Parallels", in *Research on the Dīrgha-āgama*, Dhammadinnā (ed.), 1–55, Taipei: Dharma Drum Publishing Corporation.
- Bureau, André. 1986. "L'allégorie de la Mort dans le bouddhisme ancien", *Corps Écrit*, Paris, 18: 39–45.
- Becker, Ernest. 1973. *The Denial of Death*, New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Bhattacharya, Vidhushekhara. 1957. *The Yogācārabhūmi of Ācārya Asaṅga, The Sanskrit Text Compared with the Tibetan Version*, University of Calcutta.
- Blum, Mark L. 2004. "Death", in *Encyclopedia of Buddhism*, R.E. Buswell (ed.), 1: 203–210, New York: Macmillan.
- Bodhi, Bhikkhu. 2012. *The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of the Aṅguttara Nikāya*, Boston: Wisdom Publications.



**Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 597**

- Boisvert, Mathieu. 1996. "Death as a Meditation Subject in the Theravāda Tradition", *Buddhist Studies Review*, 13.1: 37–54.
- Bond, George. 1980. "Theravāda Buddhism's Meditations on Death and the Symbolism of Initiatory Death", *History of Religions*, 19: 237–258.
- Bowker, John. 1991. *The Meanings of Death*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Burke, Brian L., A. Martens, and E.H. Faucher. 2010. "Two Decades of Terror Management Theory: A Meta-Analysis of Mortality Salience Research", *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, 14.2: 155–195.
- Cousins, L.S. 2015. "The Sutta on Mindfulness with In and Out Breathing", in *Buddhist Meditative Praxis, Traditional Teachings & Modern Applications*, K.L. Dhammajoti (ed.), 1–24, University of Hong Kong: Centre of Buddhist Studies.
- de Montaigne, Michel Seigneur 1588/1595: *Les Essais*, H. Motheau and D. Jouaust (ed.), Paris: Librairie des Bibliophiles.
- Greenberg, Jeff, T. Pyszczynski, and S. Solomon. 1986. "The Causes and Consequences of a Need for Self-esteem: A Terror Management Theory", in *Public Self and Private Self*, R.F. Baumeister (ed.), 189–212, New York: Springer-Verlag.
- Gunaratne, V. F. 1982. *Buddhist Reflections on Death*, Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Guruge, Ananda W. P. 1997. *The Buddha's Encounters with Māra the Tempter, Their Representation in Literature and Art*, Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Harmon-Jones, Eddie, L. Simon, J. Greenberg, T. Pyszczynski, S. Solomon, and H. McGregor. 1997. "Terror Management Theory and Self-Esteem: Evidence that Increased Self-Esteem Reduces Mortality Salience Effects", *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 72.1: 24–36.
- Harvey, Peter. 1991. "A Buddhist Perspective on Death", in *A Necessary End, Attitudes to Death*, J. Neuberger and J.A. White (ed.), 105–121, London: Papermac.
- Hesse, Hermann. 1943/1972. *Das Glasperlenspiel*, Frankfurt: Suhrkamp.

- Kariyawasam, A.G.S. 1984. "Death", *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, W.G. Weeraratne (ed.), 4.2: 331–335, Sri Lanka: Department of Buddhist Affairs.
- Karunaratne, Suvimalee. 2002a. "Maraṇa", *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, W.G. Weeraratne (ed.), 6.4: 632–636, Sri Lanka: Department of Buddhist Affairs.
- Karunaratne, Suvimalee. 2002b. "Maraṇānussati", *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, W.G. Weeraratne (ed.), 6.4: 636–639, Sri Lanka: Department of Buddhist Affairs.
- Klein, Anne C. 1991/1998. "Buddhism", in *How Different Religions View Death and Afterlife*, C.J. Johnson and M.G. McGee (ed.), 47–63, Philadelphia: Charles Press.
- Klima, Alan. 2002: *The Funeral Casino, Meditation, Massacre, and Exchange with the Dead in Thailand*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Kübler-Ross, Elisabeth. 1969/1982. *On Death and Dying*, London: Tavistock Publications.
- Lamotte, Étienne. 1970. *Le Traité de la Grande Vertu de Sagesse de Nāgārjuna (Mahāprajñāpāramitāsāstra)*, Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste, vol. 3.
- Malalasekera, G.P. 1938/1998. *Dictionary of Pāli Proper Names*, Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal, vol. 2.
- Marasinghe, M.M.J. 2002. "Māra", *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, W.G. Weeraratne (ed.), 6.4: 628–632, Sri Lanka: Department of Buddhist Affairs.
- Niemic, Christopher P., K. W. Brown, T. B. Kashdan, P. J. Cozzolino, W. E. Breen, C. Levesque-Bristol, and R. M. Ryan. 2010. "Being Present in the Face of Existential Threat: The Role of Trait Mindfulness in Reducing Defensive Responses to Mortality Salience", *Journal of Personal and Social Psychology*, 99.2: 344–365.
- Pyszczynski, Tom, J. Greenberg, S. Solomon, J. Arndt, and J. Schimel. 2004. "Why Do People Need Self-Esteem? A Theoretical and Empirical Review", *Psychological Bulletin*, 130: 3: 435–468.
- Reynolds, Frank E. 1992. "Death as Threat, Death as Achievement:

**Memento Mori: Recollection of Death in Early Buddhist Meditation 599**

Buddhist Perspectives with Particular Reference to the Theravada Tradition", in *Death and Afterlife: Perspectives of World Religions*, Hiroshi Obayashi (ed.), 157–167, New York: Greenwood Press.

Saunders, Cicely and M. Baines. 1983/1989. *Living with Dying: The Management of Terminal Disease*, New York: Oxford University Press.

Schmidt-Leukel, Perry. 1984. *Die Bedeutung des Todes für das menschliche Selbstverständnis im Pali-Buddhismus*, München: Missio Verlags- und Vertriebsgesellschaft.

Tripāthī, Chandrabhāl. 1962. *Fünfundzwanzig Sūtras des Nidānasamyukta*, Berlin: Akademie Verlag.

Vetter, Tilmann. 1995. "Bei Lebzeiten das Todlose Erreichen, Zum Begriff Amata im Alten Buddhismus", in *Im Tod gewinnt der Mensch sein Selbst, Das Phänomen des Todes in asiatischer und abendländischer Religionstradition*, G. Oberhammer (ed.), 211–230, Wien: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften.

Vogel, Claus. 1978. "Tod und Jenseits nach der Lehre des Buddha", in *Tod und Jenseits im Glauben der Völker*, H.J. Klimkeit (ed.), 145–157, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.

Walshe, M.O.C. 1978. *Buddhism and Death*, Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.

Wayman, Alex. 1959. "Studies in Yama and Māra", *Indo-Iranian Journal*, 3.1: 44–73 and 3.2: 112–131.

Wayman, Alex. 1982. "The Religious Meaning of Concrete Death in Buddhism", in *Sens de la mort: dans le Christianisme et les autres Religions*, M. Dhavamony et al. (ed.), 273–295, Rome: Gregorian University.

Yamano, Chieko. 2014. "Reviving the Dead and Knowing the Time of Death: Chapter Nineteen of the Kakṣapuṭatantra, Introduction, Critical Edition and Translation", *Journal of the International College for Postgraduate Buddhist Studies*, 18:23–73.